



Comment on suggestion 28

Jeff Waddell

10 pages

Comments on Suggestions

AEC's Victorian Redistribution

Jeff Waddell



To the Redistribution Committee for Victoria

I take this opportunity to comment on some of the other 66 submissions to the Victorian Redistribution as well as add some additional content to my own.

Time, other commitments and a terminal hardware failure on my home PC were against me reading every submission – I only got as far as Suggestion 52; though there are some issues raised that are worthy of additional input.

This document does not seek to repeat at length the positions stated in many of the submissions, but rather to highlight aspects of the submissions and elaborate on those.

Generally; I found the submissions could be broken down into 3 categories: Single issue submissions (most of which specifically relate to the Divisional Names of Batman and McMillan); Multi-Divisional but not whole of State submissions and Whole of State Submissions.

On the proposals relating to Divisional Names

Before addressing the details of these submissions; I should state at the outset that - in principle - I believe that historical figures should not be judged by today's standards and morals. To me, it smacks too much of George Orwell's 1984 and the Ministry of Truth rewriting history.

That does not mean I condone criminal activities – regardless of which era they occurred.

I will not specifically address the accusations made in some submissions, relating to what John Batman and Angus McMillan may or may not have been responsible for. Ultimately, the Redistribution Committee will need to weigh up the information contained in the 67 submissions and determine how to – or even whether to – address the issues raised.

42 of the 52 submissions I read propose to either abolish or rename existing Divisional Names

Of the submissions I analysed in this scope, I took the following notes:

The 38th Division is to be named Burke

Submissions S25; S36; S50; S52 all propose

The 38th Division is to be named Fraser

Submissions S3; S7; S23; S45; S46; all propose.

The 38th Division is to be named Monash

Submission S17 proposes

Abolish and replace the Divisional Name Batman

Submissions S4; S8; S38; S49; proposes.

Submission S43 objects.

Massimo Amarena (S4) simply wants the Divisional Name of Batman changed.

Submission S8 from the Darebin City Council on behalf of the Wurundjeri Land and Compensation Cultural Heritage Council Aboriginal Corporation, the Yarra City Council and Darebin City Council; S38 from Reconciliation Victoria; S49 from the Wurundjeri Land & Compensation Cultural Heritage Council Aboriginal Corporation; all propose the Division be renamed Simon Wonga.

Submission S43 from Dominic Fedele objects to the Darebin Council's support of the renaming of Batman.

Abolish and replace the Divisional Name McMillan

Submissions S1; S3; S4; S5; S10; S11; S12; S13; S14; S15; S16; S18, S19; S21; S24; S30; S32; S33; S34; S40; S41; S42; S44; S48; S51, all raise this issue.

Cr. Ellis (S1) wants the name abolished and suggests the name Strzelecki was more appropriate. (I had planned to propose to the VEC at the next State Redistribution to rename Gippsland South to Strzelecki)

Peter Cubit (S3) suggests McMillan is renamed to Rose in honour of Lionel Rose. (Another suggestion I had for the VEC at the next State Redistribution to rename Narracan to Rose)

Submissions from Massimo Amarena (S4); the Leongatha Community House (S12); Ian Couper (S15); Tim Colebatch (S19); Stephen Koci (S33); Anne Mennell (S40); Letitia Clark (S48); Bass Coast Greens (S51) simply want the Divisional Name of McMillan discarded, though S51 also asks for the Bass Coast Council to be united in a single Division.

Frank & Mary Schooneveldt (S5) propose McMillan be named Gunai/Kurani; Warrigal or West Gippsland

Tony Hughes (S10) proposes McMillan be renamed Anderson in honour of Samuel Anderson.

Elizabeth Skidmore (S11) proposes McMillan be renamed Bennett in honour of Hazel Bennett.

The Bass Coast South Gippsland Reconciliation Group (S13); Rosemary Joiner (S16); Alan & Joan McColl (S18); Ian and Chris Sandiford (S21); Elizabeth Buckingham (S24); CR's Hill, McEwen, Rich and Skinner (S30); Vicki Sinclair (S32); Meg Renfrey (S34); Bronwyn Dahlstrom (S41); Gayle McHarg (S42); Chris Grummet (S44); all suggest that a replacement name is chosen by the local aboriginal population.

Merge Mallee and Wannon to create Fraser

Submission S36 proposes.

Rename Chisholm to McCubbin

Submission S3 proposes.

Knowing that Redistribution Committees are unlikely to make Divisional Name changes without what they consider good reason, I doubt this would get up even though McCubbin is a more than worthy suggestion. The Redistribution Committee are also less likely to replace a Divisional Name named after a woman with a Divisional Name named after a man. In the unlikely event the Redistribution Committee considered renaming Chisholm it may instead look to a female alternative such as Blackburn in honour of Doris Blackburn, the first Victorian female elected to the House of Representatives.

Rename Gellibrand to Child

Submission S45 proposes.

Paul Rodgers proposes that Joan Child AO be recognised as the first female speaker of the House of Representatives.

Rename Mallee to Wimmera

Submission S7 raises this issue.

Martin Gordon raises some valid arguments as to why the Divisional Name of Mallee (created 1948-9) should be replaced by the Federation Divisional Name of Wimmera (retired 1977).

This meets 2 guidelines for naming Federal Electoral Divisions as detailed on the AEC website:

Federation Divisional names
Every effort should be made to retain the names of original federation divisions.

Aboriginal names
Aboriginal names should be used where appropriate and as far as possible existing Aboriginal divisional names should be retained.

I wholeheartedly support this suggestion.

Rename Melbourne Ports to Monash

Submissions S6; S9; S14; S20; S25; S26; S27; S29; S31; S36; all raise this issue.

I am delighted that Trevor Colvin (S6); the Committee for Monash (S9); Barney McCusker (S14); Norman Kappel (S20); James Bowen (S26); Alan Greig (S27); Former Victorian Premier Ted Baillieu (S29); Jennifer Porteous (S31); Michael Hedger (S36); also propose the creation of the Divisional Name Monash. However, given previous Redistribution Committee's reluctance to alter Divisional Names without good reason and with Melbourne Ports being a Federation Division; I think an alternative Division needs to be found to carry the name, Monash. Hence I proposed that the 38th Division to the W of the Yarra be named Monash – given he was born in West Melbourne.

Rename Melbourne Ports to Kirner

Submission S7 proposes.

Martin Gordon proposes that to remove the potential for confusion between Melbourne and Melbourne Ports, the latter is abolished and renamed after Victoria's only female Premier.

An honourable suggestion: But as someone who lived in this State under the dying days of the Cain-Kirner Labor government in the early 1990's; I can clearly remember that Victoria was an economic basket-case under her leadership. A popular joke at the time was; "What's the Capital of Victoria?" A: "5 cents"

Rename Murray to Fraser

Submission S17 proposes.

Rename Wannon to Fraser

Submission S25; S50 proposes.

Dr Mulcair (S25) and Ben Ellwood (S50) both suggest that Malcolm Fraser's former seat of Wannon is renamed to Fraser.

Whilst their suggestions are absolutely logical, my memories of the 2014-5 NSW Redistribution come flooding back. Many proposals (including my own) suggested the NSW Division of Werriwa be renamed to Whitlam – the Redistribution Committee for NSW instead chose to rename the Division of Throsby to Whitlam.

Wannon is also a Federation Divisional Name, so the likelihood of the Redistribution Committee for Victoria acquiescing to these proposals is further reduced. However – as the old saying goes – if you don't ask, you don't get. ☺

Reinstate Divisional Name Henty

Submission S36 proposes

My proposed Divisional Solution

In light of reading all the submissions I did, I have a proposal that will accommodate most suggestions to varying degrees – though not all – yet still preserve both Federation and Indigenous Names

Firstly, assuming the Redistribution Committee accepts those suggestions to abolish the Divisional Name Batman, I propose that Batman be replaced with a Divisional Name which the 2010 Redistribution Committee wanted to reinstate; **Burke**.

And if Batman is renamed Burke, it will place the Divisions of Burke and Wills alongside each other in Melbourne's inner north.

Burke	1968-2003	VIC	Robert O'Hara Burke 1821–1861, a former Irish Policeman, who led the Victorian expedition in 1860 which attempted to cross Australia from south to north.
-------	-----------	-----	---

Secondly, again assuming the Redistribution Committee accepts those suggestions to abolish the Divisional Name McMillan, I propose that the Divisional Name McMillan be replaced with a Federation Divisional Name which is appropriate to the area and is of indigenous origin; **Corinella**.

Corinella	1901–1906 1989–1994	VIC	Locality name – after the original settlement on the Westernport Bay and derived from the local aboriginal language
-----------	------------------------	-----	---

And even though my submission is the only one to propose naming the 38th Division **Monash** and renaming the Division of Murray to **Fraser**; this still appeals to me as the best solution to deliver the 2 requirements of naming a Division after a former Prime Minister and accommodating the 11 submissions that proposed the adoption of the Divisional Name of Monash.

Other Single Issue Submissions

Submission S22 from Gary Mitchell requests that Yallourn North be transferred from McMillan to Gippsland. The current boundary between McMillan and Gippsland runs through the Gazetted Localities of both Yallourn and Yallourn North with the built-up part of Yallourn North in the McMillan side of the boundary.

This was one change I wanted to propose, given Gippsland's projected enrolment is nearer the bottom end of tolerance. However, had I proposed this change, I would have needed to find more electors to keep my proposed version of McMillan in tolerance which could have meant dividing Pakenham or re-drawing Flinders.

Multi-Divisional Submissions

Nicholas Simic (S2) asks for the locality of Kealba to be located in the Division of Calwell. Whilst this suggestion could work in isolation, the fact that a new Division needs to be created in this area in addition to a surplus of electors from McEwen to be transferred to Divisions further south means this suggestion is unlikely to be met.

David Mulholland (S28) suggests changes to the Jagajaga electorate involving exchanges of electors with Menzies, Batman, Scullin and McEwen. In isolation this suggestion has merit, however is unlikely to be met as it transfers more electors from SE Divisions to NW Divisions.

CR's Davies and Zographos (S35) from the City of Monash focus their proposal on the Divisions of SE Victoria.

I believe there are better solutions than Aston crossing west into Monash to supplement its numbers. Their proposed Chisholm still stretches from Box Hill North all the way S to Oakleigh. Others have proposed the Monash Fwy as a stronger southern boundary for Chisholm.

Their proposed Dunkley splits Flinders into 2 separate land entities, plus the Western Port islands of French Island and Phillip Island. This might work for Franklin in Tasmania, but surely there are better alternatives in Victoria.

Michael Hedger (S36) proposes that Mallee and Wannon are merged to create the new Divisional Name of Fraser. The flow of electors to Divisions further E would then allow 2 new Metropolitan Divisions to be created in the city's N and W.

Maroondah City Council (S37) rightly highlights its current situation as being fragmented between the Divisions of Casey, Deakin and Menzies and proposes to be incorporated into the Division of Deakin – as that is where the greater percentage of Maroondah LGA voters are currently located.

Whilst their proposal in isolation could probably be met, the arising question is; from where does Menzies gain the balance of its electors? It could either cross the Yarra into Jagajaga – which has been proposed by Dr Mulcair though even he acknowledges this is hardly the ideal solution – or it can push S into Whitehorse LGA possibly using at least part of Whitehorse Rd as its southern boundary. In doing so, it would cross both Koonung Creek and the Eastern Freeway - which have been a respected boundary at both State and Commonwealth levels for some time.

The Nationals (S39) argue that Divisions should not be constructed that are part urban and part regional. I find their proposal to transfer the Foster and Wilsons Promontory SA2's to Gippsland from McMillan surprising. This divides South Gippsland Shire as well as Latrobe City between Gippsland and McMillan. I would have

thought they would have at least proposed Pakenham to be transferred out of McMillan given earlier statements in their submission.

Out west, they also propose splitting both the Glenelg and Southern Grampians LGA's.

The Nationals propose the transfer of the Colac Otway LGA to Wannon from Corangamite in line with many other submissions. Their proposal to transfer only Corangamite's portion of the Golden Plains LGA to Wannon is surprising, though they support my proposal to transfer Central Goldfields LGA from Wannon to Bendigo.

Overall, this proposal tends to fragment more LGA's than it unites.

Catherine Cowie (S47) proposes the creation of the Divisional Names of Gillard, Hawke & Fraser at the expense of the Divisional Names of Gellibrand and Hotham.

Her detail on the history of Divisional Names and the Redistribution process made for a thoroughly enjoyable read. Even though naming Divisions after former Prime Ministers whilst they are still living is not unprecedented; the fact that it hasn't occurred since 1955 means that the Redistribution Committee is unlikely to set a precedent of naming Divisions after living Prime Ministers on its watch.

Colin McLaren (S52) proposes that the 38th Division incorporate Melton, Sunbury and parts of the Macedon Ranges council. I struggled to wrap my head around the rest of the suggestion.

Whole of State Submissions

Private Individuals

S7: Martin Gordon.

As highlighted in Mark Mulcair's Submission S25; ["At recent state and federal redistributions, a small group of independent contributors has emerged \(Jeff Waddell, Darren McSweeney, Martin Gordon, Paul Blackman, Mark Yore, and myself\) who are not associated with any political party but have a strong interest in the redistribution process."](#)

Martin has been contributing to electoral Redistributions not only at Commonwealth, but also at State / Territory level for many years.

Like me, Martin proposes transferring the part of Macedon Ranges LGA currently in the Division of Bendigo to McEwen. He also proposed that the balance of Golden Plains LGA is transferred out of Ballarat to bring that Division back within tolerance.

Martin also proposes that Chisholm be re-oriented more E-W and not extend further S than the Monash Fwy.

We also appear to align our proposed McEwen – Scullin boundary within Whittlesea LGA.

S19: Tim Colebatch.

I understand Tim's logic in where he is going with proposed Divisions, but he's working with his own estimated enrolment numbers 4.5 years ahead.

The projected enrolment numbers the AEC has asked us to work with are as at 25/8/2019 – a little under 2 years from now.

As I stated in my submission, Victoria remains on track to gain a 39th Division at the 2020 Determination (assuming the next federal election is held in 2019)

Gaining a 39th Division would throw all of Tim's +4.5 year calculations out the window.

S23: David Walsh.

Some of David's proposals mirror mine – Skeleton Creek as a significant part of the Lalor – Gellibrand boundary; Scullin becomes a wholly City of Whittlesea LGA Division; his version of McMillan also excises Pakenham and picks up the balance of Bass Coast LGA.

Overall it's quite a sound submission.

S25: Dr. Mark Mulcair.

Mark also identifies the "incorrect" N-S orientation of Bruce and Chisholm and proposes the transfer of Glen Waverley from Bruce to Chisholm.

We are also in general agreement on returning parts of the Bellarine Peninsula to Corangamite; transferring the Colac-Otway Shire to Wannon (his Fraser) and excising the balance of Golden Plains Shire from Ballarat.

Mark also touches on the possibility of renaming Murray to Fraser if the Redistribution Committee decides against his original proposal of Wannon. Something I totally support as it was in my original submission.

We are in complete agreement in transferring the balance of Macedon Ranges Shire from Bendigo to McEwen and I absolutely support his observations about NOT splitting the City of Greater Bendigo LGA to supplement any shortfalls in Murray or Mallee.

His solution to addressing the surplus of McEwen is in many ways similar to mine.

In the Division of Melbourne, he also supports excising all of Moonee Valley LGA from the Division. His proposed changes around Wills and Batman do not align with mine. The Redistribution Committee for Victoria should note that this part of the world is Mark's "patch" and he would be the Subject Matter Expert for where to draw the ideal Divisional boundaries in this part of the northern suburbs of Melbourne.

In line with other suggestions, including my own, Mark suggests that Scullin now wholly draw its numbers from within the City of Whittlesea LGA; proposes Skeleton Creek be part of the new Lalor-Gellibrand boundary N of the Princes Freeway.

His proposal to set Bruce's northern boundary along the Monash Fwy – Wellington Rd mirrors mine.

Mark's proposal to exchange electors between Melbourne Ports and Higgins is quite a sound one, and if I had the time to review my submission again, is probably one that I would incorporate - even though I was loathe in splitting Stonnington Council. Mark's observations of different communities of interest in Stonnington's west compared to its east are valid.

S45: Paul Rogers.

Paul proposes transfer of electors within the Greater Dandenong LGA from Hotham to Isaacs in line with other submissions including my own.

Paul also supports the transfer of all of Pakenham into La Trobe and the transfer of the SA2's of Belgrave – Selby and Upwey – Tecoma into Aston.

Paul sees the need to remove the Kinglake SA2 from Indi and transfer Yarrawonga into Indi from Murray to supplement Indi's numbers.

Like many other submissions, he proposes that the Colac Otway LGA is transferred from Corangamite to Wannon.

His proposals around re-aligning the Corio – Corangamite boundary around greater Geelong and the Bellarine Peninsula are very similar to mine.

In the northern suburbs, Paul, like many other submissions, proposes uniting all of Banyule LGA in Jagajaga.

I'm not in favour of his proposal to make both McEwen and Calwell part urban-part regional Divisions.

S46: Darren McSweeney.

Of the regular independent contributors to Electoral Redistributions at both Commonwealth and State/Territory level, I often find my thoughts more closely aligned to Darren McSweeney's than any other contributor.

His submission often details logic that I have applied in my own submission but not documented, and his suggestion for this Redistribution is no exception.

His proposal to excise Pakenham from McMillan is similar to mine as is the transfer of the balance of Bass Coast Shire from Flinders into McMillan to offset the loss of Pakenham.

Though Darren proposes no changes to either Gippsland or Dunkley; mine are minimal.

He – like others – proposes the southern parts of the Yarra Ranges LGA transfers to Aston. The part of Holt he proposes to transfer to Bruce is identical to mine.

He transfers the Wantirna and Bayswater SA2's from Aston to Deakin with no changes to the boundary of Casey with either Menzies or Deakin.

In the northern suburbs his proposed Maribyrnong also extends out to include Melbourne Airport.

Out west, his proposed changes to Wannon (adding Colac Otway and removing Central Goldfields to Bendigo) mirror mine. He also supplements Corangamite's numbers with the balance of Golden Plains Shire from Ballarat.

His changes to Mallee also are very similar to mine, though we disagree on the uniting (or not) of Loddon Shire into Mallee.

Again like many others, his transfer of the balance of Macedon Ranges Shire into McEwen is an obvious one.

S50: Ben Ellwood.

Ben's solution for the Melbourne Metropolitan West Divisions is not dis-similar to mine and many others. His new Division is primarily a City of Brimbank LGA Division with a touch of City of Maribyrnong. He also proposes to unite the entire City of Moonee Valley LGA in Maribyrnong.

Overall it's a well put together submission, though I don't necessarily agree with all the boundaries he proposes.

In Closing

There is no doubt the Redistribution Committee for Victoria faces a challenging task re-drawing Victoria to accommodate 38 electoral Divisions within the current and projected enrolment tolerances.

It is also obvious that a number of independent contributors (both regular and infrequent contributors) have provided similar proposals of where proposed boundaries should be drawn and where electors of one division need to be transferred to another.

There's an old saying that goes "Great minds think alike"; and I think that the Redistribution Committee for Victoria should give multiple submissions making the same proposals added weight in their deliberations.

It is my hope that the Redistribution Committee for Victoria will propose electoral boundaries that are drawn fully in compliance with Sections 66 (3) and (3A) of the Commonwealth Electoral Act and not take the "Existing Boundaries First" approach that the Redistribution Committee for Queensland did. They should be in no doubt they will be called out for it at the Objections to Proposal stage if they do.

I wish the Redistribution Committee for Victoria well in their deliberations and look forward to the publication of their proposal in 2018.

+++ End of Document +++